

Port Noise Liaison Committee – Public Meeting

Notes of Meeting held on 4 December 2024

Present:

Mara Wolkenhauer (Independent Chair)

Mike Wheeler – Motion Health

Alan Worthington - DCC

Port Otago

Grant Bicknell – Port Otago

Kristina Goldsmith - West Harbour Community

Joanne Dowd – Port Otago

Board Representative

Brendon Shanks – Marshall Day Acoustics

Mike Cummings - Otago Regional Council – via VC

4 members of the public in attendance

Noise Committee Members

Rachel Day - Carey's Bay Association

Dave Cormack - Wenita Forest Products

Fred Cross – Vision Port Chalmers

Joe Cecchi – Carey's Bay Association

Steve Duder – Port Chalmers Yacht Club

Apologies:

Kevin Winders – Port Otago

Welcome from Meeting Chair

Mara opened the meeting at 5.32pm and welcomed the public and the committee with a karakia to the last meeting of the year. 4 members of the community attended the meeting.

Apologies

Apologies noted above were accepted.

Minutes of previous meeting (2 September 2024)

The minutes recording the meeting on 2 September 2024 were accepted as a true and complete record of the meeting.

Moved by the Chair. Seconded by Dave McCormack.

Actions Schedule from Previous Meeting

Actions & Progress from the September 2024 Action List were noted including:

- Cruise Ship Code of Conduct – with the commencement of the cruise ship season the code of conduct guideline is now being implemented. The guideline is a formalisation of existing protocols between Port Otago and Cruise vessels. It is not available for public distribution as it is commercially sensitive.
- Trial of Noise monitoring system – Brendon advised that the new noise monitoring system is not ready for commercial deployment as it still has some integration issues to resolve so this action remains ongoing.
- Property at 11 Beach Street – agenda item.
- Updated noise contour model - agenda item.

Correspondence

No correspondence received in the previous period.

Public Issues of Concern

The Chair opened the floor to the public to raise any points of concern they wanted to discuss.

Two members of the public noted that they were interested in understanding why the Committee only dealt with the issue of noise and not wider environmental issues as was the case back in 2019.

Joe gave some background to the evolution of the PNLC as he is one of the longest serving members. Alan Worthington also provided some background context to the District Plan process that set up the requirements for the PNLC and its focus on noise. Grant noted that general environmental issues fall within the remit of the West Harbour Community Board and the Dunedin City Council. Both organisations liaise directly with Port Otago if there are issues that are relevant to port operations that arise.

Joanne noted that she is the environmental planner for Port Otago who has responsibility for port related environmental issues including compliance with consent requirements. Joanne noted that she is happy to discuss any port related environmental issue with the community.

Reports

Update from Port Otago

Grant noted that the Polaris service was about to finish and would be quieter on the terminal now that the service was completed. A new service called Northern Star has commenced with slightly larger and newer vessels.

The cruise season has started with the new season cruise team in place. The number of ships calling to Port Chalmers and Dunedin is less than last year and this is reflected in other ports around New Zealand. There has been a noticeably greater presence of climate protesters visible in Port Chalmers as the cruise season has kicked off. This has created some safety challenges particularly out at sea and has seen the defacing of the gun emplacements out at Taiaroa Head.

The port has been quieter than usual due to international shipping variability but there will be an uplift in log activity.

The rail-pad replacement project is due to commence in February so there will be some disruption to port operations while those works are being undertaken.

Joe noted that there had been complaints around scrubber smoke from cruise ships and Grant noted that this is something that we are working with the cruise lines to understand the underlying issue.

Question raised from the public gallery, around the different horn warnings that are sounded on the harbour. He felt it would be useful if Port Otago could provide some information on harbour safety including identifying what the different horn warnings mean and maybe publish that information either in the ODT, Rothsay News or in an annual newsletter. Grant noted that we would look into this in conjunction with the Harbourmaster (who would typically deal with this type of information and educational awareness).

Noise Reporting – Presentation from Marshall Day

Brendon from Marshall Day briefly highlighted the key points of the pre-circulated quarterly noise report. Brendon noted that several noise sources have been identified as causing spikes in the Ldn (1

day) monitoring. This was predominantly related to wind and fire sirens. The Port noise level was not above 67 dB Ldn (5 day) at any monitoring site. Brendon noted that the Cemetery monitor was off-line between 9-23 August 2024 due to the batteries being stolen. Therefore, no data was recorded at this site during this time.

In terms of bangs and crashes the numbers appear consistent with a quiet operational time at the port.

Brendon also gave a presentation on the annually updated noise contour plan. He noted that there have been minor changes to Port Otago buildings near the main entrance to the port. The noise model has been updated to reflect these changes. The noise model operating assumptions (i.e. location and duration of noise sources) have not changed from the previous version of the model.

He noted that silencers have now been fitted to the Rio vessels, which significantly reduces the low frequency noise and removes the 'rumble' effect. However, there are still periods where "unsilenced" generators are required to operate in extenuating circumstances. Lessons learned from Port Otago's intervention in this issue are now being applied more broadly to all container vessels visiting New Zealand ports.

A question from the public gallery related to the number of ships that were noisy. Brendon noted that the NZ Ports keep a record of all ships that had received noise complaints in an NZ Noisy Ship register. He noted that nationally there were typically around 15-30 complaints associated with the various shipping vessels per year. He noted that the NZ Ports sought to undertake noise measurements on these ships to confirm the noise rating and whether there were options available to undertake noise mitigation works. Brendon noted that in the majority of cases only one onboard generator can be silenced as it is difficult to retrofit the second generator due to the ship configuration.

A member of the public gallery noted that he had recently had double glazing fitted and rather than reduce the noise he has found that some noise is amplified (due to an overall quieter surrounding). Brendon noted that the low frequency noise can penetrate windows and walls. In properties that have had acoustic treatment 17mm glass stops the reverb that can be experienced.

Noise Complaints

The Chair referred to the pre-circulated report on noise complaints and asked Joanne to give an overview of the report. Joanne noted that there had been 7 complaints in this quarter, 50% of which had come from the other side of the harbour (Portobello and Macandrew Bay). All complaints had been followed up. It was noted that one of the complaints related to the CMA CGM Quelimane. It was discussed that liaison is occurring between the ship owners and New Zealand Ports to address noise from this vessel and options for noise mitigation are being considered.

Island Terrace Property Update

Joanne noted that since the last meeting, two electrical firms had been approached to provide a quote to install mechanical ventilation at the Island terrace property. One firm had since provided a scope of works and fee estimate to fit mechanical ventilation. The firm noted that given the age of the property, its piled construction method, lack of insulation in the wall and ceiling and single glazing, meant it was a challenging property.

Mike noted in the list of noise complaints that the homeowner didn't seem to understand what the mechanical ventilation system was for. Joanne explained, in response to that specific complaint, a copy of the noise assessment report prepared by Marshall Day, was provided to the homeowner. That report outlined the technical background and reasoning for the mechanical ventilation. Joanne also

noted the comments made by the electrical company and highlighted that two previous offers had been made to purchase the property in the past, both of which were declined by the property owner.

Joanne noted that the offer of assistance to the homeowner would be made based on the fee estimate received from the electrical company and would be in accordance with the Noise Mitigation Plan (i.e. an offer to cover 50% of the cost of installing the mechanical ventilation). The letter of offer had been sent to the homeowner on 4 December.

Other Business

Rachel queried some of the language used by the Chair, ensuring its independence from the Port. Mara thanked Rachel for raising this important issue and ensured the committee members of her independence and her commitment to getting this right. Mara also reiterated that being able to openly discuss constructive feedback like this is an important function of the committee and should be encouraged.

No other business was proposed.

Next meeting, date, time, and location

Suggested dates for the 2025 Port Noise Liaison Committee meetings to be agreed with Committee Members.

Suggested dates are as follows:

- Wednesday 5 March 2025
- Wednesday 4 June 2025
- Wednesday 3 September 2025
- Wednesday 3 December 2025 (Public Meeting)

Meeting closed 7.05pm

Actions

Meeting date	Action	Responsible	Due	Update
April 2024	Marshall Day to confirm if the results of the trial of the new monitoring system will be available this year	Marshall Day	Ongoing	MD will maintain a watching brief and report back at next meeting. Budget provision for the upgrade of the noise monitoring equipment replacement.
June 2024	Provide update of noise monitoring at Beach Street property.	Marshall Day/Joanne	Q3 2024	External noise monitoring will be undertaken to determine the level of nuisance
Sept 2024	Establish a conflict-of-interest register, to deal with potential conflicts of interest as they arise	Joanne	Q1 2025	
Dec 2024	Prepare Noise Fact Sheets for public dissemination	Joanne	Q1 2025	
Dec 2024	Port Otago to review options for handheld noise monitors that could potentially be reintroduced and operated by Port Otago PPO team when complaints come in	Port Otago IT/Joanne	Q1 2025	